



**Haverhill Public Schools - School Committee  
Hybrid Regular Meeting Minutes of April 25, 2024**

SC 05.09.24 6 A

Governor Healey has extended pandemic-related authorizations thereby allowing remote and hybrid meeting options for public bodies through March 31, 2025.

Mayor Barrett read the following statement published for the record: those attending tonight's meeting should be aware that the meeting is being audio and video recorded by HCTV, ET and WHAV. Any audience members who wish to record any part of the meeting must inform the Chairperson who will announce the recording. This is to comply with the MA wiretap statute.

**Roll Call.**

Mayor Barrett, Chairperson called the meeting to order (7:00 pm) and requested a roll call vote:

Ms. Collins	Present in person	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Present remotely
Ms. Diaz	Present in person	Dr. Story	Present in person
Ms. Ferguson	Present in person	Ms. Sullivan	Present in person
Dr. Grannemann	Present in person	Attorney Magliocchetti	Present in person
Mrs. Lalumiere	Present in person	Mayor Barrett	Present in person
Attorney Rosa	Present in person		

Superintendent Margaret Marotta, Superintendent and Assistant Superintendent Michael Pfifferling were also in attendance.

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited by the school committee and members of the public.

**Communications/Reports.**

**Public Comment (In-person & Remote).**

Ms. Barbara Greenwood, 426 Chadwick Road, Haverhill, MA, a JGW staff member made a statement on behalf of the JGW staff (several members including HEA President Barry Davis stood alongside her at the podium). She stated that the work environment was hostile and there had been a recent vote of non-confidence in Principal Matthew Condon and Assistant Principal Heather Koch. She commented on the fall 2023 climate and culture survey, in which 100% of HEA staff were extremely concerned with school safety and school discipline. Ms. Greenwood related there was a lack of structure and consistent enforcement of discipline rules and regulations. She noted that leadership did not treat the staff with dignity including vindictive behaviors and threats to staff. Ms. Greenwood expressed that there was one-sided communication and no collaboration. Ms. Greenwood stated there had been a lack of response from both the superintendent and school department's human resources department. and work environment, she indicated that the HEA Executive Committee met with both administrators, asked for intervention by the school committee. Ms. Greenwood concluded that the staff had no confidence in the school's leadership.

Ms. Samantha Torres, JGW Staff member, spoke in support of her father, Dick Early, Jr. regarding his candidacy for the Whittier Tech school committee seat. She noted his many community activities in Haverhill. Ms. Torres commented that the children and community of Haverhill was his passion. She highlighted many of his efforts at Whittier including assisting students who were applying and those who were not successful in their application process. Ms. Torres provided a definition of corruption and applied it to the Haverhill School Committee.

Ms. Janice McNulty, volunteer at Whittier Tech, spoke in support of Dick Early. She noted his support and funding for athletics, vocational education and volunteer activities. Ms. McNulty believed it would be a great loss if he was replaced on the school committee.

Mr. John Jarvis, spoke in support of Dick Early and his assistance with veterans.

Ms. Rosanna O'Connell, commented on her son's unsuccessful application to Whittier Tech and the appeal process. She explained that after the principal upholding the rejection, her parents appealed to Mr. Early. Ms. O'Connell reported that Mr. Early advised continuing with the appeal process. She commented that the superintendent reversed the rejection and her son was allowed to attend Whittier.

Mr. Sean Gallagher, Director of Operations, Master Plumber, spoke about his son's rejection to attend Whittier. He advised that the student work with a tutor to get his grades up so that he could reapply and possibly be admitted into the school. Mr. Gallagher stated that Mr. Early called him every week to check in on his son's process.

Mrs. Kathy Sullivan Rurak, 700 Broadway, spoke on the long friendship between the Rurak and Early families. She emphasized that her comments were her personal opinions. Ms. Sullivan Rurak commented on his successful career in Haverhill and the awarding of five (5) scholarships to students. She believed his experience was crucial in the coming years.

Mr. Ken Morse, spoke in support of Mr. Condon and Ms. Koch at Whittier School. He was a member of the site council and the school administration had advocated for the modular classrooms. Mr. Morse believed the school was moving in the right direction and there was parent support.

Mr. Chad Pfeil, former parent member of JG Whittier site council, was shocked to hear about the staff concerns regarding Mr. Condon and Ms. Koch, since it was never brought to the site council.

Mr. Donald Charlesworth, noted his appreciation of the community service done by the school committee. He was present to support his friend, Dick Early and his dedication to public service. Mr. Charlesworth's mother was a former educator in Haverhill and community volunteer. He stressed Mr. Early's unselfishness and dedication to students and the community.

Ms. Cathy Bonnell, parent of two students at Hunking School. She spoke in support of Mr. Early. She commented on his exceptional character, moral compass and integrity. Ms. Bonnell believed it was an unfair process.

Mayor Barrett requested the reason Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello was not present in person at tonight's meeting. Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello stated the reason was personal illness (which was supported by a doctor's note).

#### **Student Advisory Council Report – Melanie Palacios.**

Ms. Palacios reported that tomorrow was the last day of spirit week "Freaky Friday" {students dressed as teachers and teachers dressed as students}. She noted that earlier this week on Tuesday, there was a powder puff game with the Class of 2024 becoming back-to-back winners. Melanie stated that the early college presentation would be completed next week and she would be providing a presentation at the next school committee meeting. Finally, Ms. Palacios announced an upcoming walk-a-thon to fund a student resource room (personal hygiene, etc.).

**Ms. Diaz: Introduction of YMCA representatives to provide programming updates;** [Happenings at the Y.pdf](#); [Cap Decorating FINAL.pdf](#); [Final Girls United.pdf](#); [Updated Interview Training Flyer.pdf](#); [Bouquets Final.pdf](#).

Ms. Kiana Rios, Youth Services Director and Ms. Karissa Forzese, Membership Director provided information on children and teens/tween activities at the Y. Mrs. Tracy Fuller, Regional Executive Director, Haverhill & Plaistow YMCAs was also in attendance with her colleagues.

Ms. Diaz thanked the Y for its involvement with our students.

Attorney Magliocchetti appreciated the YMCA's efforts.

Attorney Rosa commented on his own children's involvement at the Y. He asked that tonight's information be provided to Mrs. McGillicuddy for distribution to the committee.

Ms. Collins appreciated the collaboration.

**Approval of the Memorandum of Agreement between the Haverhill School Committee and the Haverhill Public Schools' Administrative and Supervisory Group [Memorandum of Agreement HPSSAG FINAL 3-28-24.doc.pdf](#).**

Attorney Magliocchetti stated that the agreement was approved in executive session and now has to be approved in public session. He added that the agreement had been ratified by the administrative group.

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to approve the Memorandum of Agreement between the Haverhill School Committee and the Haverhill Public Schools' Administrative and Supervisory Group. Dr. Story seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative  
0 members voted in the negative  
0 members abstained

Motion passes

**Approval of the Memorandum of Agreement between the Haverhill School Committee and the Maintenance Employees (SEIU 888) [Haverhill Maintenance CBA 3.26.24.docx.pdf](#).**

Attorney Magliocchetti stated that the agreement was approved in executive session and now has to be approved in public session. He added that the agreement had been ratified by the maintenance group.

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to approve the Agreement between the Haverhill School Committee and the Maintenance Employees (SEIU 888). Dr. Story seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative  
0 members voted in the negative  
0 members abstained

Motion passes

**Approval of Working Conditions/Salary Proposal for non-unit therapists [Non Unit Therapists 4.3.24.xlsx - 4.9.pdf](#).**

Attorney Magliocchetti stated that there were periodic agreements with this group of non-unit

employees. He related that the agreement had been approved in executive session and now it needed to be approved in public session. Attorney Magliocchetti added that the agreement had been ratified by the non-unit therapists.

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to approve the Approval of Working Conditions/Salary Proposal for non-unit therapists. Dr. Story seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative                      Motion passes  
 0 members voted in the negative  
 0 members abstained

**Approval of the non-unit personnel salary proposal [04-23-24 Non-Unit COLA \(1\).pdf](#).**

Attorney Magliocchetti indicated that the non-unit personnel salary had been reviewed several times in executive session and the final version was approved in executive session and now it needed to be approved in public session.

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to approve the non-unit personnel salary proposal Dr. Story seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative                      Motion passes  
 0 members voted in the negative  
 0 members abstained

**Superintendent Comments/Reports.**

Introduction of Ms. Heidi Perez, Director of ML Grades K-12 [Haverhill Public Schools MLE Department \(1\).pdf](#).

Ms. Perez provided a detailed overview of the MLE Department in the Haverhill Public Schools. She noted that the Haverhill Public Schools had been invited on May 6, 2024, to the Boston Children’s Museum, for a “Day of Play ” for multilingual learners (513 students). Ms. Perez indicated that another visit had occurred in January, 2024 where the invitation had been extended to HPS for another day. She concluded by thanking the committee for its support.

Dr. Story thanked Ms. Perez for instilling the sense of belonging with families and students. She asked about the family literacy program and the participation levels and goals.

Ms. Perez responded that there were 40 seats available for adults every 12-weeks. She indicated at least 100 people had participated so far in the program. Ms. Perez commented on the complexities and challenges.

Ms. Collins asked about teachers and students’ perspectives. She inquired about teachers being overwhelmed teaching students with multiple languages.

Ms. Perez answered that instruction was provided in English, with assistance in the native language. She noted that SEI strategies were incorporated along with support (professional development) and coaching for teachers. Ms. Perez concluded that there was continued work to promote inclusivity.

The superintendent apologized to the YMCA for not distributing the PowerPoint since it was “stuck” in her inbox.

Superintendent Marotta made a statement on JG Whittier School.

Sort of address the elephant in the room, you know, and while I'm not going to discuss individual personnel matters publicly, as that would be a violation of our employees' rights. I do want to state that as superintendent, I understand and acknowledge the concerns expressed by the union. I think it's important to recognize the gravity of such actions and the underlying issues that have brought us to this point. However, I firmly believe that the administration at Whittier and at all of our schools are dedicated to the well-being and success of our students.

And, staff and the school community in general have consistently demonstrated the commitment to our students into fostering a positive learning environment. While disagreements and tensions may arise, I believe it's crucial that we work together collaboratively to address any concerns and to strive for solutions that benefit everyone involved. Open communication and a constructive dialogue are essential in overcoming challenges and building a stronger, more unified school community.

As superintendent, I'm committed to facilitating this process and to ensuring that all voices are heard and respected. My goal is to focus on finding common ground and to move forward in the best interest of our students and our schools as a whole. I think it's very, you know, it's a difficult time to be an educator. On all ends of that spectrum, whether you're a teacher or an ESP or a clerk in the office, or as the superintendent of schools. It's just a really difficult job right now. So I understand the tensions. I understand that everyone feels heightened and everybody's looking for a solution. But I just hope that instead of maybe pointing fingers at each other we can try to work together to make things better. For ourselves and for the students in our community.

### **Recommendation and Approval of School Calendar for 2024-2025.**

Superintendent Marotta stated the school calendar for two weeks would be posted on the website and other locations for comment and review and recommended calling the superintendent's office with any feedback.

Mrs. Lalumiere suggested adding school committee meetings to the student calendar.

### **School Committee Reports/Communications.**

#### Mrs. Lalumiere: Brightside Update.

Mrs. Lalumiere announced that three planters with sponsors and donations had been secured for each school. She clarified that the donations would support student enrichment offerings. Mrs. Lalumiere reported on the sponsorship of each planter with two (2) donations, so far Lalumiere Family (Golden Hill) and local author Daniel Hines (Stories Podcast) at Walnut Square She acknowledged that there was a policy against advertising on school property and was requesting

a vote tonight.

Attorney Rosa thanked Mrs. Lalumiere for her work on this matter. He suggested that Mrs. Lalumiere check with the State Ethics Commission regarding her families' planter.

Mayor Barrett advised checking on the use of her name on the planter.

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to approve two (2) planters as presented in Mrs. Lalumiere's proposal. Attorney Rosa seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardiello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative  
0 members voted in the negative  
0 members abstained

Motion passes

Mrs. Lalumiere asked if anyone was interested in a planter. She added that there would be tree planting tomorrow at Tilton School.

Attorney Magliocchetti was interested in a planter.

**Policy Subcommittee: Revote of agenda items from the March 14, 2024, meeting to address possible open meeting law issue. Item Policy BDFB Appointments to the Whittier Regional Vocational Technical High School – School Committee to be added to the agenda of the April 11, 2024, for re-discussion and vote.**

Attorney Magliocchetti left the room at 8:30 pm.

Attorney Rosa clarified the open meeting law issue had been addressed at the last meeting. He noted the policy was included in the meeting materials.

Dr. Story had supported formalizing the process for filling the vacancy on the school committee in February 2024. She thanked Mr. Early for his dedication. Dr. Story highlighted regular reports to the Haverhill School Committee. She was disappointed in the process to date. Dr. Story was concerned with one particular aspect, i.e., the overly cumbersome and politicization of the position and process.

Mrs. Lalumiere commented that if there was preference for a school committee member it needed to be in the policy. She asked for a conversation on this item.

Ms. Collins noted the newness of the school committee and the growing pains. She stressed that the best process for Haverhill was concerned with preference for 11 people in filling this position. Ms. Collins highlighted the difference in length of terms 2 years and 3 years. She was not in favor of the preference for a school committee member and supported striking 3 iii.

Ms. Sullivan was satisfied with the explanation of the objection.

Dr. Grannemann appreciated the policy subcommittee's work. He noted the significant Whittier Tech budget and upcoming building projects. Dr. Grannemann stressed the importance of accountability.

A motion was made by Dr. Story to strike paragraph (3 i). Ms. Collins seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	No
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes		
Attorney Rosa	No		

9 members voted in the affirmative  
 2 members voted in the negative  
 0 members abstained  
 Motion passes

Dr. Story would like to review 5 iii since it was not needed in the policy due to the political nature.

A motion was made by Dr. Story to strike 5 iii. Ms. Ferguson seconded the motion.

Ms. Collins stated that it was an area of accountability.

Attorney Rosa stated that 5 iii was included per the advice of the city solicitor to insert in the policy.

The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	No	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	No	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	No
Dr. Grannemann	No	Mayor Barrett	No
Mrs. Lalumiere	No		
Attorney Rosa	No		

3 members voted in the affirmative  
 8 members voted in the negative  
 0 members abstained  
 Motion fails

A motion was made by Attorney Rosa to approve Policy BDFB Appointments to the Whittier Regional Vocational Technical High School – School Committee as amended. Ms. Sullivan seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	No
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes		
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

10 members voted in the affirmative  
 1 member voted in the negative  
 0 members abstained  
 Motion passes

**School Committee: Statements by Candidates for the Whittier Regional Vocational Technical High School - School Committee, followed by the vote.**

Ms. Sullivan believed a school committee member was a requirement for the Whittier Tech school committee. She commented that the process was confusing city solicitor advice was reversed, apologies to the public, taught for 15 years at Whittier Tech, the importance of the school, only child went to teach there for 15 years until brain cancer of diagnosis, serving on the school committee would be a way of honoring, devoted to Haverhill, my pleasure and honor to serve the students.

Mr. Early thanked the school committee along with his family, especially his mother and daughter. He noted that his heart was dedicated to the school. Mr. Early commented on his good work ethic and finished several ongoing projects. He provided several examples of helping students and thanked the school committee.

Dr. Grannemann spoke in strong support of Gail Sullivan’s candidacy based on her educational, financial and school building experience.

Ms. Ferguson highlighted all the efforts of Mr. Early for children and supported his candidacy partly due to character, dedication and philanthropic efforts.

Ms. Collins stated it was a wonderful burden with amazing candidates and our students and community were privileged to serve in this role.

Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello spoke in support of Dick Early and his dedication. She noted his commitment and indicated no one could do a better job.

The vote was held:

Ms. Collins	Dick Early	Attorney Rosa	Gail Sullivan
Ms. Diaz	Dick Early	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Dick Early
Ms. Ferguson	Dick Early	Dr. Story	Dick Early
Dr. Grannemann	Gail Sullivan	Ms. Sullivan	Gail Sullivan
Mrs. Lalumiere	Dick Early	Mayor Barrett	Richard Early

Mr. Richard Early was reappointed to the WRVTHS School Committee by a 7-3 vote.

Mr. Early thanked the committee for its support.

Attorney Magliocchetti returned to the meeting.

**New Business.**

Superintendent’s Recommendation to approve Warrant Number EV2024030426, and EV20240426B, totaling \$1,312,121.18, as indicated in the agenda material.

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to approve Warrant Number EV2024030426, and EV20240426B. Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative  
 0 members voted in the negative  
 0 members abstained  
 Motion passes

Superintendent’s Recommendation to approve Warrant Number 20240426A totaling \$2,134.11, as indicated in the agenda material.

A motion was made by Attorney Rosa to approve Warrant Number 20240426A. Mrs. Lalumiere seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:



Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardiello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Abstain
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

10 members voted in the affirmative                      Motion passes  
0 members voted in the negative  
1 member abstained

**Items by Consensus.**

Superintendent’s Recommendation for Approval of the Hybrid Regular Meeting Minutes of April 11, 2024, and the Remote Special Meeting of April 8, 2024, as indicated in the agenda material.

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to approve the Hybrid Regular Meeting Minutes of April 11, 2024, and the Remote Special Meeting of April 8, 2024. Mrs. Lalumiere seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardiello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative                      Motion passes  
0 members voted in the negative  
0 members abstained

A motion was made by Attorney Magliocchetti to adjourn the meeting (8:39 pm). Ms. Ferguson seconded the motion. The mayor requested a roll call vote with the following results:

Ms. Collins	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardiello	Yes
Ms. Diaz	Yes	Dr. Story	Yes
Ms. Ferguson	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Dr. Grannemann	Yes	Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes
Mrs. Lalumiere	Yes	Mayor Barrett	Yes
Attorney Rosa	Yes		

11 members voted in the affirmative                      Motion passes  
0 members voted in the negative  
0 members abstained