



**Haverhill Public Schools - School Committee
Regular Meeting of June 8, 2017**

Ms. Gail Sullivan, President called the Regular Meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. Present: Mr. Sven Amirian, Mrs. Maura Ryan-Ciardello, Attorney Paul Magliocchetti (arrived at 8:20 pm), Mr. Shaun Toohey, Mr. Scott Wood, Vice President, Mr. Jared Fulgoni, Assistant Superintendent and Mr. James Scully, Superintendent of Schools. Mayor James Fiorentini, Chairperson arrived at 7:58 p.m..

This message is read before each meeting: those attending tonight's meeting should be aware that the meeting is being audio and video recorded by HCTV (add any other media outlet/party which tells you they will be recording). Any audience members who wish to record any part of the meeting must inform the Chair who will announce the recording. This is to comply with the Massachusetts wiretap statute.

Public Comment

Deb Schultz 15 Kali Way who is a district employee speaks on behalf of OT/PT non-unit group. She articulated the dedication of this group and how these positions achieve savings through Medicaid reimbursement to the school district. Ms. Schultz noted that through this year, a small group of therapists had worked updating working conditions and salaries. She further stated that a proposed six-step salary scale had been developed which would cost \$220,000 in one year and Ms. Schultz commended John O'Connor and his staff members Krysten and Judy for their work.

Christie Broderick 35 Eleventh Avenue, a certified therapy assistant who was born and raised in Haverhill stated her salary was inequitable and was paid below 1998 pay scale. Ms. Broderick asked for the committee to address the inequities and injustices.

Peter Yannakoureas, 85 Millvale Road noted his attendance at frequent meetings to oppose the teaching of evolution (Darwin) that contained racist's views. He wanted this addressed.

Ms. Sullivan responded it is a curriculum decision and the superintendent's makes the decision on these matters and there is a chain a command.

Katrina Hobbs Everett 41 South Pleasant acknowledged the recent passing of high school student Bryce and suggested the committee focus attention on high needs students and programming/outreach that would assist these students.

Lisa Begley and Cara Labelle, Health teachers at Haverhill High School thanked the School Committee and City Council for the positive changes that had occurred within health instruction in the district.

Ms. Begley provided examples of students work in writing (books that depicted poor life choices with drugs) across the curriculum and differentiated instruction. She outlined one example of the premise that Santa was a bully for not letting Rudolf drive the sleigh. Ms. Begley also related that there were choices and students could be "opted" out of any portion of the health curriculum.

She introduced each of the following students who spoke on each topic

- Juan Garcia (school program's help prevent society's dangers and connect with students who have similar mind sets – the school environment is a protective factor)
- Jack DiTonno (health organizations that help)
- Andres Lopez (cultures and social behaviors – values – personal health and morals)

- Shaun Glass (values – principles of behaviors/judgment – a paper bag represent our identities and had to cut out examples of the student i.e., working out and dog lover)
- Reilly (bullying examples – her example was Donald Trump – the President made improper comments about people who had disabilities and harmful and vulgar words against women)
- Alexa Richard (hazing – pledge to group – do something against your will – serious matter)
- Jason Love (Addiction on the Brain – effects different parts of brain)
- Kiley Murphy (drugs affect people around you – she utilized a mock children’s book)
- Gracie Hood (the drug bath salts and its effects on people – brown bear, brown bear what do you see – people around you are effected by drug use)
- Mary Miller (Inhalants – its effects)
- Morgan (tobacco and its dangers – lung capacity)
- McKenzie Schiavoni (emergency care – alcohol poisoning)
- Poisette (opiates – do not mean to get addicted – highly addictive – overly prescribed painkillers – Narcan – share the booklets entitled InkbloTT)

Cara Labelle, fellow health teacher commended Mrs. Begley for all her efforts and ability to work with different teaching styles. She noted the following events/topics that had been addressed at the high school, which made it a really exciting time for health education.

- Yellow Dress – poetry play about domestic violence – does not have a happy ending
- MVP Program this year – students educating other students about communication – electronic communication
- 84 Project – part of the movement for Haverhill to go to 21 for smoking – tobacco and dangers of smoking – teach an elective – drugs and culture elective
- A free curriculum The Truth about Drugs – all digital – freeze – consequences and ripple effect – every drug they could come into contain – short and concise – no sugar coating
- First Aid Program – First Aid Frenzy – more time to teach health – quick reference – free resource
- LGBQ topic, students are able to opt in and opt out of this topic and there is no penalty – courses and training deal with the subject matter in an open manner with the students – it is in the beginning stages of curriculum development

Ms. Labelle concluded it was a very good year – do not know everything – great year

Mr. Scully acknowledged a student had helped a family member who was choking with the Heimlich maneuver, which the student had learned in school.

Superintendent Comments/Reports – Mr. Scully had no comments or reports.

Communication and Reports

Mayor Fiorentini arrived at the meeting and Ms. Sullivan relinquished chairing the meeting.

Student Advisory Council Report

Ms. Yepes was looking forward to representing Hillie Nation at these meetings. She related that there were only 8 days of school left this year. She outlined the following upcoming events and activities:

- Fall sports Pre-Season Meeting - The 2017 Fall Sports pre-season meeting has been scheduled on Tuesday, June 13- at 6:00 p.m. in the Auditorium. All students interested in playing a fall sport next year are required to attend along with at least one parent or guardian. Information regarding tryout schedules, participation requirements, rules and regulations and much more will be covered at the meeting. This includes current eighth graders our incoming freshman too! Falls sports include Cheerleading, Cross Country, Crew, Field hockey, Football, Golf, Soccer, Girls Swimming and Girls Volleyball.
- The Class of 2020 is having a fundraiser at the 99’s on June 13th from 4:00 pm to 10:00 pm. Please help support the Class of 2020.
- Our AP teachers have been meeting with students for the new school year coordinating the expectations and summer work for their classes.
- VIP - Our VIP team and the Epilepsy Foundation are looking for donations of clothing, shoes, jewelry, linens, toys, books, sports equipment, and more for a fundraiser. They are taking donations now through June 15

- HHS Glee Club is having a show next weekend on June 15- and 16- at 7:00 in the Auditorium. Tickets are \$7 and \$5 for seniors and students at the door.

Ms. Yepes concluded by commending the high school administrators and guidance staff for providing support to the students during the year.

School Committee Communications

Request of Ms. Sullivan to introduce Janet Begin to discuss expansion of preschool programs

Mrs. Janet Begin 89 Lincolnshire Drive provided the members with an overview of a preschool expansion program and possible collaboration with the Haverhill Public Schools as detailed in the attached presentation here:

https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B_ylQjIUbvunQm1fQWJ4RII3YTQ/view?usp=sharing

Mayor Fiorentini spoke of the value of Montessori Education. He related that after speaking with the Superintendent he would sponsor two slots once money had been identified.

Request of Mr. Amirian for the history and current status of Medicaid Reimbursement

Mr. Amirian thanked Brian O'Connell, Business Manager for his assistance. He related that hopefully it would be the first of many conversations. Mr. Amirian highlighted some key points relative to Medicaid reimbursement:

- Direct service to our student population
- Administered by OT/PT school nurses
- Students on IEP need these services for education
- Not all services are reimbursable
- Required by IEP to give services
- Large dollar figure – go out of pocket one year and get reimbursed the next year
- Historically bill out and assume cost – receive 50% back
- Money goes to the general fund of City – there is not necessarily parity in what we expend and what we get back
- UMASS Medical School Computer System charge to utilize this service (\$9,000-\$10,000)
- Log gross services by staff to accurately account what services were delivered
- Net amount goes to City - \$370,000 - \$500,000
- Students have to be Medicaid eligible and parents voluntarily allow us to bill Medicaid (cannot automatically bill) – still provide services but may not be able to bill for services
- FY14: \$867,852 - expended \$433,926 – received; FY15 \$700,096 – expended and \$397,983 - \$370,000 possible reimbursable for FY17 but this is only half of what we actually expend for services – could be closer to \$500,000
- No money would come back from the government – improve practices – aware of the flow of the money – goes to the City –
- Mayor affords this reimbursement in the amount that he can raise the minimum school spending – look at the increase – 6.33% level service – meet the needs – total is 7.1% supplemental to augment service offerings - \$569,000 – a wash with Medicaid reimbursement

Mr. Amirian would continue to educate himself on Medicaid reimbursement.

Public Hearing - FY18 Budget

Mr. Thomas Grannemann 51 Leroy Avenue from Haverhill Education Coalition

- Small step forward builds on last year's 5% increase last year
- Haverhill is still lagging behind
- Higher increase
- Areas that need to examine early literacy, dropout prevention, coaching for professional development (article he will share copies)
- Additional funds for professional development linked to high school

- Investing in teachers

Mayor Fiorentini stated other schools such as Brockton and Methuen were laying off teachers.

Mr. Richard Smyth, 2 South New Street

- Budget workshops of May 16, 25, 31, 2017
- Pressure to rush the budget
- Start earlier in budget preparation
- Enough time to prepare
- Clearer process – citizens are paying attention – opportunity
- All budget meeting be televised to provide more transparency and a digital record
- Work to develop a better system so citizens will have more trust in our city government

Ms. Helen Zbitnoff, 28 Brandon Road

- A parent of three children
- Since 2008 when Silver Hill Horace Mann Charter School began it allowed for measurable data to support education
- Meet needs and show growth
- Data driven decision-making and provides documents in its five year plan
- Meet standards
- Asking for greater transparency and accountability
- Hold to high standards
- Develop a strategic plan
- Do not maintain the status quo

Joanne Dixs, 28 Bartlett Avenue - A special needs teacher in Greater Lawrence Tech & parent

- At-risk populations affect our budget
- Legal and ethical responsibility to support our students
- Reacting to bad data
- Over-representative of economically disadvantaged
- Properly fund early education and early literacy skills
- Strategically focus – reactive not proactive – proper funding
- Be proactive and not reactive

Jeffrey Martineau, 46 Russet Hill Road

- Tied to equity in the system
- 18- largest districts
- 505 educators - \$67,000 average - \$78,000 state
- Mr. Scully's salary is \$213,000 and the State average is \$163,000
- Equitable salaries not only in the Superintendent's Office
- Salaries are tied to performance of Superintendent
- If schools are not good, the City will not attract young people to stay in Haverhill
- Advocated for reduction to non-essential costs to the district– outsource custodians (36) - \$90,000 (mechanic) - \$140,000 vehicle repair – seems priorities are askew

Mayor Fiorentini responded that the city was taxing at 2.5% tax levy and this upcoming year there would be a \$190 tax increase. He strongly advised against taxing over and above Proposition 2½ along with Water/Wastewater bill increases.

Dr. John Maddox 122 Lakeview Avenue

Dr. Maddox thanked Mayor and Mr. Michitson for Tilton Library and presented Council President Michitson with two signed books of Malcolm Mitchell's book for Councillor Michitson and LePage.

Mayor Fiorentini related that the allocation of city money was to match Maddox Foundation's contribution. He noted that the City was deeply indebted to Dr. Maddox.

Dr. Maddox

- Passed out documents to the Committee
- DESE data shows that in the demographic category entitled “economically disadvantaged” has increased each year
- The economically disadvantaged students present challenges and their families are under stress and strain
- More falls on the schools to assist these children and families
- Per pupil expenditures that districts are ranked from 1-320; in 2005 Haverhill was ranked 190 and in 2015 Haverhill is now ranked 300
- Audits from FY15 and FY16 showed a decrease
- Good job by Mayor in financial management – Haverhill was ranked #1 by Auditors

The Mayor indicated that the 7.1% increase in the school budget was difficult. He noted the tradeoff and balance. Mayor Fiorentini stated that Assistant Superintendent Fulgoni had stated that this was the largest increase in educational funding.

Dr. Maddox asked if the professional development funding was adequate in this year’s budget.

Ms. Sullivan stated that the budget was heavily reliant on grants. She noted that with the current administration (Trump) threatened to cut Title IIA. Ms. Sullivan noted that professional development spending was very low and did not support teachers’ need, which is why she requested an additional \$261,000 to support this area.

Dr. Maddox noted the district should be spending \$1.4m on professional development.

Mrs. Ryan-Ciardillo, a former educator in the district noted her concern about the need for professional development.

Mr. Maddox commended Mr. Wood’s championing of dropout prevention. He noted that of 1821 that would have graduated in 2016, 107 students dropped out. He asked about Don Davoli’s wait listed program

Mr. Wood related that an allocation of an additional \$25,000 to the program would address the waitlist of students who had health issues, teen moms, or working students. He noted that this motion passed and was included in this budget. Mr. Wood was not satisfied but was a step in right direction.

Dr. Maddox asked about Mr. Amirian’s vote against budget.

Mr. Amirian responded that the budget did not adequately address the needs and he requested an increase by \$335,000. He felt it was his job to advocate for the school system.

Dr. Maddox referenced FY17 Chapter 70 Attachment E, which indicated that Haverhill would receive \$307,000 additional monies. He credited this extra money to the work of Representative Dempsey.

Dr. Maddox commented that Greenleaf is not closing and you are renegeing on that promise. He stated that Greenleaf is not a conducive learning environment and the \$385,000 could be better utilized. Dr. Maddox was upset that the budget was approved prior to the public hearing and that the committee had an option to amend budget. Additionally, the School Committee had time to do it right for the children of Haverhill.

Mayor Fiorentini related no additional Chapter 70 funding would be received.

City Councilor Andy Vargas noted that there was a movement in Haverhill and a change of mentality. He stated that there was a movement from a culture of scarcity to a culture of civic education.

Mayor Fiorentini stated the City Council could cut other areas to fund the education budget.

Ms. Dena Papanikolaou Hyatt Avenue

- Thanked the committee for their public service
- Value children's education
- Health of city is its infrastructure
- According to DESE our school system is not healthy
- Dr. Grannemann has been careful with his analyses and identifying the scope of the problem
- Investments of so many citizens who are engaged in the issues and it is a step forward
- Graduation and dropout rates are dismal
- 45 students – two classrooms of kids – dropped out
- Lag in per pupil spending – 18% below
- Cost effective budgeting and more research based and data driven
- Strategic planning and better budget planning
- Lackluster commitment to professional development
- Does the budget do enough
- Haverhill Education Coalition have reflected on
- Questionable procedural vote on the budget on May 3, 2017
- Entertain amendments
- Sending message that budget is enough
- Discussions unfold

Jeff Martineau

- SHHMCS Rechartering ties to the budget
- Access to ELL – school indicated that it had not been funded for the position – MOU signed by legal binding document (2014)
- SHHMCS note funded equitably

Mr. Scully stated the district was in compliance with issues at SHHMCS.

Attorney Magliocchetti stated that ELL teacher was in Group E of Superintendent's request.

John Michitson, 119 Kenoza Street

- Mayor is not the boogey man
- Progress in budget over the years
- Financial stability is worthy
- Tug of war in City – demographics
- Moody's lower rate because services are increasing
- More people are struggling – that is the trend
- Other Gateway Cities are in the same negative spin
- Public Education – Public Safety – Economic Development – good strong public education – safe community and needed jobs – all three are not at appropriate capacity
- He recommended fully funding Group B of the Superintendent's listing per Mr. Amirian
- Police has a five-year plan for better safety – certain amount of police over the five years
- Additionally economic development has cost sharing of positions
- Recommendation for a City Planner and rezoning
- All three areas need improvement otherwise figures will get worse
- Strong recommendation for a City Strategic Plan – he has been asking for this plan for 20 years
- Great job of moving Haverhill forward by Mayor Fiorentini

Mayor Fiorentini supported medical marijuana and there were options for facilities in Haverhill that would bring in additional revenue (\$300,000).

A motion made by Ms. Sullivan to add \$100,000 to the budget for the purpose of a literacy coach at Bradford Elementary, Golden Hill, Pentucket Lake, and Tilton. Attorney Magliocchetti seconded the motion.

Mayor Fiorentini ruled the motion out of order. You can only cut or reallocate.

Attorney Magliocchetti thanked everyone and noted he had left an earlier commitment to attend this meeting.

Attorney Magliocchetti's stated his dissatisfaction with professional development for a district this size, his recommendation was for approximately \$700,000.

Ms. Sullivan related that a motion had been made at the May 31st budget workshop and she asked Ms. Cassano to read the motion: A motion was made by Ms. Sullivan to submit a request to the Mayor a reserve \$261,000 if Title IIA grant funding is cut. Mr. Toohey seconded the motion. She noted that the motion has passed 6-1.

Attorney Magliocchetti's observations included:

- In a meeting with principals, five principals requested social workers – that is the answer in a difficult solution
- Discussion as a community to address the dropout rate and what is going on at home
- Staff with knowledge and expertise to work in this area some district's have 7 social workers at high schools
- Demographic influences for our decisions and will determine our demographic
- Mayor has done a tremendous job
- – 10 social workers - \$800,000 to \$1m to make things better – not sure if we can accomplish this outcome – will to do this – areas to cut – however, show me a plan where the money is going – so complex –
- Mayor deals with the city's finances on a daily basis and is very
- Former Mayor James Waldron, his mentor had advised Mayor Fiorentini to file for bankruptcy
- City is at a cross roads and the direction needs to change either voluntarily or by force
- Leaders have to have the will to take the steps necessary for our children and in our citizens – build up our community and schools

Ms. Sullivan noted that if we could get control of sped tuition (\$1.5m in Groups B & C and this figure is stunning. She stated new Sped Director should be tasked with providing services in-house and decreases out of district placements.

Mr. Amirian concurs with Attorney Magliocchetti since he has become the Chamber Board Chairperson. He related the complexity of the social and emotional wellness of economically disadvantaged children and there is not do not have enough money or not utilizing correctly.

Mr. Amirian made a motion requesting from Mayor to allocate all of the Medicaid reimbursement of \$500,000 is directed towards the FY18 budget.

Mayor Fiorentini stated it was already in the budget.

Mr. Amirian made a motion to request an additional \$500,000 from the Mayor for the FY18 budget. Attorney Magliocchetti seconded the motion.

Mayor Fiorentini asked where the money would come from in the budget.

Mr. Amirian indicated the Mayor would need to find the money.

Mr. Wood clarified that the Committee would be sending a letter to the Mayor requesting this money.

The chair called for a vote of the members:

Mr. Amirian	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes	Mr. Toohey	Yes

Mr. Wood	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Mayor Fiorentini	Yes		

7 members having voted in the affirmative

Mayor Fiorentini's comments:

- Do better for our schools
- \$32m rehab for high school
- Chairman of HSBC (Hunking School) and led fight
- \$19m increase over the past four years
- Increased performance is not tied to increased spending
- Targeted expenditures such as social workers
- The book entitled "The Prize" detailed the effort to raise funding in Newark - \$200m - \$20m effect on education was negative – home problems need to be addressed and targeted
- Hale Debt is \$10m debt – largest municipal debt in the state
- Must maintain our fiscal stability
- In recent arbitration, the bond rating was discussed one notch drop would cost us \$8m
- He would try his best

Mr. Wood's observations:

- Any elected official wants to do more but we can deliver everything
- There is no Assistant Business Manager
- Mechanic (2), tasked plumber and electrician who work on maintenance issues and it saves us money
- Business Manager was a part-time person at \$80,000 not a full-time salary
- Legal obligation to pass balanced budget

Mr. Maddox asked if a majority had voted no the school budget on May 31, 2017.

Mayor responded that the committee would have voted to fund nothing for public education and shut the schools down.

Dr. Maddox asked if it was a legal vote on the budget on May 31, 2017.

Mr. Wood stated that the district had a legal obligation to lay off employees, which would lead to unemployment costs.

Attorney Magliocchetti noted that Haverhill had a strong Mayor government.

Dr. Maddox asked that the Committee rethink the budget.

Mr. Scully stated the reality was seven days to open schools in September.

Subcommittee Reports

Attorney Magliocchetti reported that the Policy Subcommittee was meeting bi-weekly with Mike Gilbert from MASC.

New Business

Mr. Wood made a motion to approve Warrant Number EV20170609 totaling \$258,264.06 as indicated in the agenda material. Mr. Toohey seconded the motion.

The chair called for a vote of the members:

Mr. Amirian	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes	Mr. Toohey	Yes
Mr. Wood	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Mayor Fiorentini	Yes		

7 members having voted in the affirmative

Mr. Wood made a motion to approve Warrant Number EV20170609A totaling \$46,283.14 as indicated in the agenda material. Mr. Toohey seconded the motion.

The chair called for a vote of the members:

Mr. Amirian	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Attorney Magliocchetti	Abstain	Mr. Toohey	Yes
Mr. Wood	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Mayor Fiorentini	Yes		

6 members having voted in the affirmative
1 member abstained

Mr. Toohey made a motion to approve Warrant Number EV20170609B totaling \$443,488.05 as indicated in the agenda material. Mr. Wood seconded the motion.

The chair called for a vote of the members:

Mr. Amirian	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes	Mr. Toohey	Yes
Mr. Wood	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Mayor Fiorentini	Yes		

7 members having voted in the affirmative

Items by Consensus

Mr. Wood made a motion to approve the minutes of the Budget Workshop of May 16, 2017, Budget Workshop of May 25, 2017, Budget Workshop of May 31, 2017 and the regular meeting of May 25, 2017 as indicated in the agenda material. Mr. Toohey seconded the motion.

The chair called for a vote of the members:

Mr. Amirian	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes	Mr. Toohey	Yes
Mr. Wood	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Mayor Fiorentini	Yes		

7 members having voted in the affirmative

Ms. Sullivan made a motion to go into executive session (10:36 a.m.) for the purpose of hearing two Level III grievances filed against the school district by a member of Custodial Unit – the committee will reconvene in Open Session. Attorney Magliocchetti seconded the motion.

The chair called for a vote of the members:

Mr. Amirian	Yes	Mrs. Ryan-Ciardello	Yes
Attorney Magliocchetti	Yes	Mr. Toohey	Yes
Mr. Wood	Yes	Ms. Sullivan	Yes
Mayor Fiorentini	Yes		

7 members having voted in the affirmative